From: <u>Trujillo, Rita, NMENV</u>

To: Norem, Nancy

Cc: Kim, Gi-Dong, NMENV; Mustafa, Sufi A., NMENV; Uhl, Mary, NMENV; Kuehn, Elizabeth, NMENV

Subject: FW: Comments on the BART modeling report for the San Juan Generating Station

Date: Monday, July 30, 2007 2:07:41 PM

Nancy -

Here is a comment on the PNM BART analysis from Gi-Dong Kim. Gi-Dong is the dispersion modeler who has been assigned to review the analysis.

Rita

From: Kim, Gi-Dong, NMENV

Sent: Monday, July 30, 2007 2:00 PM

To: Trujillo, Rita, NMENV Cc: Mustafa, Sufi A., NMENV

Subject: Comments on the BART modeling report for the San Juan Generating Station

Nancy,

In the process of reviewing the BART modeling report for the San Juan Generating Station, I found a serious flaw in the analysis. It is the use of average visibility improvements to determine cost effectiveness of the SCR and Hybrid technologies. The Regional Haze Rule requires visibility improvements at each and every wilderness area, not average regional improvement. It is obvious from looking at the tables in the report that the lesser improvements at further out wilderness areas is washing out significant improvements at places closer in such as Mesa Verde and San Pedro Parks. PNM must not use the fact that it is impacting 16 wilderness areas to prorate the cost of visibility improvements. At the very least they should be basing cost effectiveness on the maximum impact reduction at a single Class 1 area. If you have any comment, please let me know.

Gi-Dong

Gi-Dong Kim Air Quality Bureau New Mexico Environment Department 2044 Galisteo Street Santa Fe, NM 87505 Tel: (505) 955-8023

Fax: (505) 827-1543

Email: gi-dong.kim@state.nm.us
